

# A better alternative for Ocean Access at Bastion Point is possible:

## ***Comparison of Designs – Option 3b Vs Alternative Concept***

The East Gippsland Shire Council has proceeded with Option 3b as its preferred ocean access development at Bastion Point with the objective that, a major breakwater facility along with associated infrastructure and relocation of the launch ramp will:

- Reduce conflicts between swimmers, surfers and boats;
- Create safe ocean access; and
- Facilitate growth of boating and nature based tourism and the commercial fishing industry.

The following table dispels this myth.

It also demonstrates that an alternative concept that includes an upgraded boat ramp without breakwaters at the site of the existing facility will better address safety concerns and meet preferred design features. It shows that:

- Safety and risk mitigation methods identified by the Australian Maritime College Search Ltd. (AMCS) safety audit can be readily applied to an upgrade at the existing site.
- That tourism growth in ocean boating is unlikely given weather limitations and parking restrictions for safety reasons.

The key used in the table below includes the following ratings:

- ✓ Somewhat satisfies
- ✓✓ Fully satisfies
- x Does not meet most aspects of objective
- xx Does not meet any aspects of objective
- xxx Significant downgrade with safety, environmental and economic consequences

<b>Design/Safety Feature<sup>1</sup></b>	<b>Option 3b</b>	<b>Alternative Concept at Existing Site</b>
Design of ramp and associated works in accordance with relevant standards	✓✓	✓✓
Construction cost	xx Twice to quadruple costs with breakwater and causeway road, with associated depreciation and maintenance costs	✓✓ <i>Car park costs slightly more, causeway road, breakwater and channel excavation costs eliminated</i>
Ongoing maintenance/siltation costs	xx Sand removal estimated at 15-20.000 cu m per annum along with expensive dredge, breakwater and boardwalk maintenance	✓✓ <i>Sand removal in the vicinity of current costs</i>
Excavation/maintenance of boating channel	Operational management plan	Operational management plan

<sup>1</sup> The design/safety features in this table incorporate recommendations from the AMCS audit and must be applied to Option 3b to mitigate risk to the lowest rating possible given the inherent risks associated with boat launching at Bastion Point.

<b>Design/Safety Feature<sup>1</sup></b>	<b>Option 3b</b>	<b>Alternative Concept at Existing Site</b>
Minimise boating footprint	xxx Long extensive carpark and significant increase across beach and reef	✓✓ <i>Car park rationalised, no significant increase above existing area currently utilised on beach</i>
Total number trailer bays (number large bays)	35 (10)	35 (10)
Use dredge in non peak periods where possible	Operational management plan	Use sand removal system when required. Operational management plan
Make use of helicopters for rescue services where appropriate	Operational management plan	Operational management plan
Catastrophic risk during egress/entrance of boats to ocean	x Monitoring and management risk classified moderate/high due to breakwater.	<i>Better visibility. Rating to be determined.</i>
Boater experience	xx Better launch conditions at ramp, but with catastrophic waterway impacts	✓✓ <i>Better launch conditions at ramp</i>
Boat holding structure to facilitate loading & unloading and boat retrieval	✓✓	✓✓
Growth in boating tourism	xxx Weather dependant. Limited by trailer park availability, future expansion restricted by safety issues, car park size restricted to sheltered boat holding area behind breakwater	xxx <i>Weather dependant. Limited by trailer park availability, future expansion restricted by safety issues, car park size restricted to sheltered boat holding area</i>
Maximum distance ramp to boat trailer	x 416 m	✓✓ 214 m
Time to walk to trailer (assume 3 km/hr)	xx 8.3 min	✓✓ 4.3 min
Disabled car parks and access for disabled beach users	unknown at time of print	✓✓ 3
Swimmer –boater separation at beach access	xx Swimmers and boaters mixed carpark. Operational management plan	✓✓ Clearer separation of swimmers to northern beach access. Operational management plan

<b>Design/Safety Feature<sup>1</sup></b>	<b>Option 3b</b>	<b>Alternative Concept at Existing Site</b>
Swimmer –boater separation in water	Special Use Zone required. Operational management plan	Special Use Zone existing. Operational management plan
Surfing	xxx 'Broken Boards' surf break lost. Operational management plan	✓✓ Recreational surfing maintained. Operational management plan
Safe pedestrian access to southern end of Bastion Point	xx Pedestrians cross at most dangerous point - boat launch pad	✓✓ <i>Pedestrians cross at point with visibility to both directions</i>
Loss of beach recreational area (compared to current)	xx 140 m of foreshore plus rocky reef and surfing area	✓✓ <i>none</i>
Loss of visual amenity due to breakwater and causeway beach road	xx High, leading to loss of nature-based tourism and wilderness coast/heritage listing values	✓✓ <i>No to little loss of amenity over current ramp</i>
Loss of vegetation on headland	xxx Car park clearly visible from World Heritage area and caravan park	✓✓ <i>Vegetation clearing significantly reduced</i>
Loss of coastal vegetation	4,400 sq. m.	3,000 sq. m.
Aboriginal cultural heritage	xx Middens consigned to roadside verge, loss of aboriginal 'sense of place'	✓✓ <i>Middens not impacted in any way</i>
Protect environmental values at inter-tidal zone (rock pools/reef)	xxx inter-tidal zone rock pools/reef destroyed	✓✓ <i>inter-tidal zone rock pools/reef preserved</i>
Wilderness, whale watching, dive/fishing charter	✓✓ Weather dependant/seasonal	✓✓ <i>Weather dependant/seasonal</i>
Commercial fisheries	✓✓ Boat launch and retrieval significantly improved	✓✓ Boat launch and retrieval significantly improved
Marine National Parks Policing/management	✓✓ Boat launch and retrieval significantly improved	✓✓ Boat launch and retrieval significantly improved